

Verification Report

Eastern Africa Regional Statistics Program-for-Results, for Rwanda, August 2024

United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA), Addis Ababa.

Executive Summary

The Eastern Africa Regional Statistics Program-for-Results (EARSP-for-R) is aimed to support the harmonization, availability and use of core economic and social statistics in East Africa. Fund is disbursed to the national statistics offices of Kenya, Rwanda, and Tanzania under the program to accomplish specific Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) requiring independent verification. The UNECA as the Independent Verification Agency (IVA), is contracted by EAC to undertake verification of a subset of the EARSP-for-R Disbursement Linked Results (DLRs) following established verification protocols and methodologies.

In the July verification window, Rwanda has submitted 5 (five) DLRs for verification. The National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda (NISR) through the East African Community (EAC) - Regional Program Coordination Unit Secretariat (RPCU) requested verifications for DLRs:

- DLI 1.1: Improved harmonization and quality of statistics: DLI:1.1(a) Published metadata for household surveys following international standards.
- DLI 2.4: Improved availability of administrative data: DLI: 2.4 (c) Publication of thematic reports and district profiles using data from 5-RPHC.
- DLI 2.4: Improved availability of administrative data: DLI:2.4 (d) Disseminated results of the Establishment Census.
- DLI 2.5: Improved availability of price and macroeconomic statistics: DLI:2.5(a) Monthly consumer and producer price indices available online for 2022 to 2023.
- DLI 2.5: Improved availability of price and macroeconomic statistics: DLI:2.5(b) Report for Travel Expenditure survey published for 2022 and 2023.

The verification procedures consist of checking the required reports and microdata are produced and available online on the NISR website. A preliminary assessment report was sent by UNECA to the EAC for comment before writing this draft verification report.

The final result of the July 2024 verification process is:

- DLI 1.1(a)- Achieved.
- DLI 2.4(c)- Achieved.
- DLI 2.4(d)- Achieved.
- DLI 2.5(a)- Achieved.
- DLI 2.5(b)- Achieved.

I. Introduction

1. Background

The Eastern Africa Regional Statistics Program-for-Results aims to strengthen the harmonization, availability and use of core economic and social statistics generated from the national statistics programs of Kenya, Rwanda and Tanzania. The Program under the East African Community and Africa Union, is planned to support statistical activities of implementing countries from 2022 - 2027 within the strategic themes of SHaSA2. During the program period, the World Bank finances it following the disbursement-linked results mechanism focusing on the achievements of specific results.

The EARSP-for-R is structured into three result areas with disbursement-linked indicators and identified disbursement-linked results. Hence, implementing agencies (national statistics offices) are expected to report their country-specific achievement of disbursement-linked results to the Regional Program Coordination Unit (RPCU) of EAC. These results must be independently verified to disburse the related trench of funds.

To verify the results of the DLIs reported by national implementing agencies, the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA) through the African Centre of Statistics (ACS) has been contracted as an Independent Verification Agency (IVA) by the East African Community for a set of DLIs.

2. Disbursement-Linked-Indicator (DLI)

The EARSP-for-R program is structured into three results areas (RA), in which the DLRs are linked with respective RA. The result areas have specific Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs). The DLI and result area in which this verification is conducted:

- ***Results area 1: Harmonization, quality, dissemination & use of statistics.***
 - DLI 1.1: Improved harmonization and quality of statistics.
- ***Result Area 2: Availability and New Data Sources.***
 - DLI 2.4: Improved availability of administrative data.
 - DLI 2.5: Improved availability of price and macroeconomic statistics.

This report presents findings relative to DLI 1.1(a), DLI 2.4(c), DLI 2.4 (d), DLI 2.5 (a) and DLI 2.5 (b) for Rwanda as reported by the National Institute of Statistics Rwanda (NISR) for July 2024 verification window.

3. Independent Verification

In the July verification window, the following DLRs were subjected to a set of verifications procedures undertaken by the independent verification agency (UNECA).

- DLI 1.1(a) - verification that NISR published metadata for LFS, DHS, SAS household surveys following international standards and downloadable from the NISR website.
- DLI 2.4(c) - verification that NISR produces 15 thematic reports, 30 district profile reports and the refugee status reports and downloadable from the NISR website.
- DLI 2.4 (d) - verification that NISR disseminate the 2023 Establishment Census report and microdata available from the NISR website.
- DLI 2.5 (a) - verification that NISR produce monthly consumer and producer price indices reports for 2022 to 2023 and data on Excel downloadable from the NISR website.
- DLI 2.5(b) - verification that NISR produces the 2022 and 2023 Travel Expenditure survey report and downloadable from the NISR website.

II. Methodology

The verification procedures followed by UNECA:

- **DLI 1.1(a). Rwanda Published metadata for household surveys following international standards:** NISR provided necessary links with relevant documents and data to verify the results. The methodology for checking the DLR involved UNECA checking the NISR website using the links to download metadata for household surveys (LFS, [link](#)), (DHS, [link](#)), (SAS, [link](#)) from the NISR [website](#).
- **DLI 2.4(c). Rwanda publishes thematic reports and district profiles using data from 5-RPHC.** The methodology for checking the DLR involves UNECA using links provided by NISR to download the 15 thematic reports ([links](#)) including refugee status ([link](#)) and 30 district profiles report ([link](#)) from the NISR [website](#).
- **DLI 2.4(d). Disseminated results of the Establishment Census:** NISR provided necessary links with relevant documents and data to verify the results. The methodology for checking the DLR involved UNECA checking the NISR website using the links to download the report of the establishment census from the NISR [website](#). Further, it is also necessary to check the microdata available on the NISR [website](#).
- **DLI 2.5(a). Monthly consumer and producer price indices available online for 2022 to 2023:** NISR provided necessary links with relevant documents and data. The methodology for checking the DLR involved UNECA checking the NISR website to confirm that the monthly consumer price indices (CPI) for the 2022/2023 reports are available and downloadable from the NISR [website](#). Second, UNECA checking the producer price indices (PPI) for 2022/2023 is downloaded and the data is available from the NISR [website](#).

- **DLI 2.5(b). Travel Expenditure Survey published for 2022 and 2023:** The methodology for checking the DLR involves UNECA using links provided by NISR to download the Travel Expenditure Survey 2022/23 report from the NISR [website](#). It is also important to check the report to see whether it contained the results covering the national, urban and rural domains.

III. Detailed Verification Results for the DLI

1. Inspection/ Review]

The verification was done using a hybrid approach, i.e. onsite and online checking of the results.

2. Findings.

a. DLI 1.1(a)

Metadata for household surveys. The checks confirmed that Rwanda has produced the metadata for the household surveys following international standards. These include labour force survey, Demographic and Health Survey, and Seasonal Agriculture Survey. The handbooks are available and downloadable from (LFS, [link](#)), (DHS, [link](#)), (SAS, [link](#)) and the NISR [website](#). Although the LFS metadata complies with international standards, the handbook requires updates on some definitions and methods. NSIR confirmed that in collaboration with ILO and Rwanda's Ministry of Public service and Labour, NISR has already started the process of integrating the new standard on work relations in the labour force survey, anticipating to have the first publication latest Jan 2026. Further, the microdata sets of the surveys are available in the NADA V4.3 data dissemination portal and users submit the request and obtain the data after authentication.

b. DLI 2.4(c).

Thematic reports, refugee status and district profiles from 5-RPHC. The verification confirmed that more than 15 thematic reports ([links](#)) including refugee status ([link](#)) and 30 district profiles reports ([link](#)) are available and downloadable from the links provided by NISR. The thematic areas include educational characteristics, socio-economic status of Youth, socio-economic status of people with disabilities, Economic activity, Gender, population projection, non-monetary poverty, socio-economic status of elderly, migration, mortality, agriculture, fertility, marital status & nuptiality, housing, etc. Regarding access to census data, the NISR policy allowed about 10% of the data to be provided to the users upon request after anonymisation.

c. DLI 2.4(d).

Disseminate Establishment Census Result. The checks confirmed that Rwanda has produced and disseminated the 2023 Establishment Survey report and available [online](#). It is also verified that the census microdata is [accessible](#) by registering into NADA. It is noted that the establishment census was not strongly linked with the statistical business register and was independently carried out by NISR. Thus, linking the establishment census with the statistical business register (SBR) is useful to improve quality, such as completeness and coverage. UNECA suggests that for better

use of the results in the process of compiling the national accounts and the use and supply table (SUT), it would be useful to add certain elements to the questionnaires, in particular secondary or other activities, ownership structure, and employees' wages; and specify the use of census data for national accounts purposes and explain the methodology used to capture those without fixed locations.

NISR clarified that as Rwanda continues to strengthen its Business Register, particularly by updating business activities and accounting for temporary closures or business closures, NISR conducts the Establishment Census every three years to update the enterprise database. However, the process of linking the database for both the Establishment Census and SRB will be considered in the 5-year fourth National Strategy for the Development of Statistics (NSDS4) starting from July 2024 onwards. Further, the census serves as a sampling frame for business surveys such as the Annual Integrated Business Enterprise Survey (IBES), which plays a role in providing additional information on secondary or other activities required for the National Accounts and other purposes. Further, the National Accounts, among others, is the consumer of the Establishment Census results, and the SNA provides a range of ways to supplement different datasets covering the non-fixed location business and informal sector in general which are documented in the National Accounts, not in the establishment census.

d. DLI 2.5(a).

Monthly CPI and PPI available online for 2022 to 2023. The verification confirmed that the monthly CPI for 2022/2023 is available and downloadable from the [links provided](#) on the NISR website. It is noted that the published CPI is based on 100 = February 2014 with the nomenclature of COICOP 1999 with 12 divisions of household consumption, which require updates of the new classification. CPI reports from January to June 2024 are also available on the website: www.statistics.gov.rw.

Regarding the PPI, the check indicated the monthly PPI for 2022/2023 is available and downloadable from the [links provided](#) on the NISR website. The produced PPI base 100 = December 2010. As with the CPI, a renovation of the PPI is necessary to update the basket and the weights. The PPI report adopted ISIC rev.4 into 4 sectors (Mining, Manufacturing, Water, and Electricity). It is checked that both the CPI and PPI data are available on an MS Excel spreadsheet. Reports from January to May 2024 are also available on the website: www.statistics.gov.rw

e. DLI 2.5(b).

Report for Travel Expenditure survey (TES) published for 2022 and 2023.

The checks confirmed that Rwanda has produced Travel Expenditure Survey reports for the years 2022 and 2023, and the report is available and downloadable from the [link given](#) by NISR. The report presents results at national, urban and rural levels. UNECA suggest that NISR provide tourist expenditure by type of goods and services (education, health, catering, accommodation,

etc), detail methodology for calculating expenditure and expenditure by residents and non-residents is not presented; and sharing of microdata to users.

NISR confirmed that a separate report on tourism, based on TES results, is compiled and published by institutions responsible for tourism monitoring. The methodology is provided in the 2023 report, pages 1-4, and the 2022 report, pages 3-7. The approach for extrapolating results from 2022 to 2023 was explained in the report. However, in the future, it was suggested that methodology could still be incorporated into the subsequent reports to ensure clarity and easy reference for stakeholders and data users. It was also recommended that data sharing should be further examined with the end goal of adopting and implementing data sharing between and among data producers, wherever and whenever possible.

IV. Conclusions

UNECA as IVA has successfully conducted the five /5/ Disbursement Linked Results (DLRs) verification in line with the verification protocol. The process went quite smoothly during the verification period.

1. Advantages and Challenges during the implementation.

- **DLI 1.1(a), DLI 2.4(c), DLI 2.4(d), DLI 2.5(a) and DLI 2.5(b)**
 - NISR provided the necessary links and documents for the DLRs verification. They are instrumental in completing the assignment of the result verification on time. The reports are easily downloaded, and microdata sets are available and accessible to users.
 - Coordination of the verification of DLRs. The NISR assigns the responsible DLR personnel and effectively coordinates the result verification to be completed on time.
 - The slow or intermittent connection interrupts or affects the participation of some online verifying consultants in sharing observations related to the DLR with the main team.

2. Lesson learned and Recommendations

- **DLI 1.1(a), DLI 2.4(c), DLI 2.4(d), DLI 2.5(a) and DLI 2.5(b)**
 - **Adoption of the latest definitions, standards and classification.** It is worth in mentioning the need to adopt the latest definitions, standards and classification for labour metadata, HCPI and PPI to produce and disseminate quality, relevant and comparable statistics in the NSS. NISR stated that it has already started the process of integrating the new standard on work relations in the labour force survey, anticipating having the first publication latest Jan 2026.

- **Rebasing the CPI and PPI.** It is observed that CPI and PPI require updates through rebasing the base year using up-to-date data, classification, and basket of goods. The NISR plans to finalize CPI and PPI rebasing exercises by 2025. During the CPI rebasing exercise, COICOP-2018 will be adopted.
- **Coordination and communication of the verification team.** The engagement and communication of UNECA team (onsite/ physically presented and online verifying team) with NISR team was good in meeting the mission objectives. This should be strengthened in the subsistent verification of DLRs.
- **Build linkage between SBR and establishment census.** The verification highlighted that the establishment census was not strongly linked with the statistical business register. Thus, it is recommended to link the establishment census with the statistical business register (SBR) to improve quality, such as completeness and coverage. NISR indicated that the process of linking the database for both Establishment census and SRB will be considered in the 5-year fourth National Strategy for the Development of Statistics (NSDS4) starting from July 2024.
- **Importance of conducting onsite verification for the DLR.** The mission recognizes that some DLRs strongly require onsite verification. The offsite (online) verification of the DLRs has limitations and, recommends onsite verification is necessary for effective verification of results.
- **Timing of verification request.** Cognizant of the importance of having all logistics preparation in place before the start of verification, the mission requests the feasibility for EAC and implementing country to provide ECA with some indication of the domains of the DLRs/DLIs to be verified at least a month before the actual verification date.
- **Overall Observation.**
 - The collaboration and support of the NISR and EAC RPCU clarifying and providing feedback on issues related to the DLRs was substantial. This could help UNECA to complete the DLIs result verification on time.

Annexes.

Appendix1: Verification of Disbursement-Linked- Results (National Institute of Statistics Rwanda-NISR)

Disbursement-Linked-Indicator	Disbursement-linked-Result	Remark	Evidence of attachment	DLI Verification procedure	Code	UNECA Verification procedure	Result of Verification	Scalable	Links	Comments / Questions
DLI 1.1-RWA: Improved harmonization & quality of statistics	DLR:1.1(a) Published metadata for household surveys following international standards	Published metadata for household surveys following international standards	LFS metadata: https://www.statistics.gov.rw/publication/labour-statistics-metadata-handbook-2014 DHS metadata; https://statistics.gov.rw/dhs_Rwanda_2020 SAS Meta Data; https://statistics.gov.rw/publication/2149	Verification that metadata for 3 surveys has been published and made available on the NISR website.	A (i)	ECA checks metadata for the 3 surveys published and available on the NISR website.	Yes, metadata for LFS, DHS & SAS are available & downloadable from the NISR website.	No	https://www.statistics.gov.rw/publication/labour-statistics-metadata-handbook-2014 ; https://statistics.gov.rw/dhs_Rwanda_2020 ; https://statistics.gov.rw/publication/2149	Adopt the latest definition of status in employment in the next LFS.
DLI 2.4-RWA: Improved availability of administrative data	DLR: 2.4 (c) Publication of thematic reports and district profiles using data from 5-RPHC	Thematic reports (more than 15) including one on refugees- and 30 district profile reports using data from 5-RPHC are published.	1. Thematic reports: https://www.statistics.gov.rw/statistical-publications/subject/population-size-and-population-characteristics/reports . 2. Refuge report: https://statistics.gov.rw/publication/socio-economic-status-refugees-rwanda . 3. District Profiles: https://www.statistics.gov.rw/statistical-publications/subject/district-statistics/reports	Verification that 15 thematic reports - including one on refugees- and 30 district profile reports published and available online.	C(i)	ECA checks 15 thematic reports - including one on refugees- and 30 district profile reports published and available online.	Yes, thematic reports including refugees- & 30 district profile reports are available and downloadable from the NISR website.	No	https://www.statistics.gov.rw/statistical-publications/subject/population-size-and-population-characteristics/reports ; https://statistics.gov.rw/publication/socio-economic-status-refugees-rwanda ; https://www.statistics.gov.rw/statistical-publications/subject/district-statistics/reports	

DLI 2.4- RWA: Improved availability of administrati ve data	DLR:2.4 (d) Disseminate d results of the Establishme nt Census	Report of the Establishment Census 2023 is published and microdata.	1. ECS Report https://statistics.gov.rw/publication/214 ; 2. Micro Data https://microdata.statistics.gov.rw/index.php/catalog/112	Verification that Establishment Census final reports published, and microdata available online.	D(i)	ECA checks Establishment Census final reports published and microdata available online.	Yes, Establishme nt Census final report published and microdata available from NISR website.	No	1. ECS Report https://statistics.gov.rw/publication/214 ; 2. Micro Data https://microdata.statistics.gov.rw/index.php/catalog/112	link the establish ment census with the statistica l business register (SBR)
DLI 2.5: Improved availability of price and macroecono mic statistics	DLR:2.5(a) Monthly consumer & producer price indices available online for 2022 to 2023	Monthly CPI and PPI indices are available online for 2022 to 2023.	1. CPI Reports Excel file: https://statistics.gov.rw/statistical-publications/subject/consumer-price-index-%28cpi%29/reports . 2.PPI Reports & Excel file https://statistics.gov.rw/statistical-publications/subject/producer-price-index-%28ppi%29/reports	Verification that Monthly consumer and producer price indices produced for 2022 to 2023 and can be downloaded from the NISR website.	A(i)	ECA checks Monthly consumer and producer price indices produced for 2022 to 2023 and downloaded from the NISR website.	Yes, Monthly consumer & producer price indices produced for 2022 to 2023 and downloaded from NISR website.	Yes	1. CPI Reports Excel file: https://statistics.gov.rw/statistical-publications/subject/consumer-price-index-%28cpi%29/reports . 2.PPI Reports & Excel file https://statistics.gov.rw/statistical-publications/subject/producer-price-index-%28ppi%29/reports	Rebase the CPI and PPI to adopt new classification.
	DLR:2.5(b) Report for Travel Expenditure survey published for 2022 and 2023	Travel Expenditure survey reports are published for 2022 and 2023	https://statistics.gov.rw/statistical-publications/subject/travel/reports	Verification that Travel Expenditure Survey Report 2022 and 2023 produced and can be downloaded from the NISR website.	B (i)	ECA checks Travel Expenditure Survey Report 2022 and 2023 produced and downloaded from the NISR website.	Yes, Travel Expenditure Survey Report 2022 and 2023 produced and downloaded from NISR website.	No	https://statistics.gov.rw/statistical-publications/subject/travel/reports	